THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): It is not a discussion.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Just one minute only. The point is, there is a contradiction between what Mr. Shukla has said and what the Prime Minister has said. The Minister of Water Resources said that "the division of Cauvery water snall be as per the interim award until the final award is given by the Cauvery Waters Disputes Tribdnal". Secondly, he said hat a monitoring commitee consisting of Chief Engineers, of four basin states would be formed. Thirdly, he said that the Karnataka Government which had not, previously, accepted the constitution of a monitoring committee had now agreed. Now, the Prime Minister has indicated that the Centre does not intend to constitute a monitoring committee. Between Mr. Shukla's statement and the Prime Minister's there is a lot of contradiction. We want that either the Prime Minister or Mr. Shukla should come and explain. This is what we want. Mr. Shukla says one thing. The Prime Minister says another thing.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: An enormous suspicion has been created by the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu as well as by the Prime Minister.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Sir, Mr. Hanumanthappa is misleading the House by misreading the law. Award means interim award also. Interim award also is part of an award. It is the duty of the Centre to implement the award by framing a scheme. This has not been done. This is our charge. Our charge is not against Karnataka. Our charge is against the Central Government.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, the point is, this kind of one-upmanship would ultimately result in loss of innocent lives either in Karnataka or in Tamil Nadu. Therefore, it is the responsibility of all of us here to see that these passions are contained. Now, the dispute happens to be over 15 TMC feet of water.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: It is a serious matter, Mr. Swamy. It is a question of life and death for the people of Tamil Nadu.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: The Chief Minister's bogus fast has created all these problems. (*Interruptions*). The issue has to be put in perspective. They should not be fooled. The farmers of both Karnataka and Tamil Nadu should not be fooled. As I said, it is only 15 TMC feet of water. Now, the southern region pumps over 4,000 TMC feet of water into the Indian Ocean. Instead of taking steps to prevent this wastage and making it available to the people of both the States, they are indulging in this. It is this jingoism, this regional jingoism, which is creating unnecessary tension between the two States. Therefore, we should rise above this and seek a constructive, long-term, solution to the problem.

PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ, MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : मैं अब सदन का ध्यान एक गंभीर विषय की ओर दिलाना चाहता हूं। प्रश्न काल समाप्त होने के बाद ही इस सदन में एक गंभीर विषय की चर्चा होती रही जिसमें विधि और न्याय मंत्री श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज जी की चर्चा हुई जिसको ले कर सदन के बहुत सदस्य चिंतित भी थे और उत्तेजित भी थे। मैं समझता हूं कि संसदीय राज्य मंत्री डा. अबरार अहमद जो यहां थे, जिन्होंने सदन को विश्वास दिलाया था कि वे मंत्री महोदय तक इन बातों को पहुंचा देंगे, अवश्य ही उन्होंने आपको यह बातें बता दी होंगी। लीडर आफ दी हाउस चव्हाण साहब ने जैसे कि सदन को सूचित किया

भारद्वाज जी आ रहे हैं, वे अपनी बात कहेंगे। आप यहां पर आए हैं। मैं बहुत डिटेल में नहीं जा कर एक बात यह जानना चाहता हूं। भारद्वाज जी कुछ कहें उसके पहले मैं उनसे जानना चाहूंगा और सदन से भी इस बात के लिए जानना चाहूंगा कि आप जो बातें कहने जा रहे हैं वह 241 या 251 के अन्तर्गत हाउस के रूल्ज आफ प्रोसीजर के अनुसार

You are aware that under rule 241, a member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation. Then, under rule 251, a statement may be made by a Minister. There is a provision. You can make the statement under any of these two rules.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): In both the capacities.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): First of all, I would like to know from you. Being the Minister of Law and Justice yourself, you know better than, perhaps, anybody else. Are you going to make the statement under rule 241, or, under rule 251? Kindly tell me.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ): Sir, I want to make a statement as a Member of this House. If any hon. Member is agitated on account of any conduct of mine, I have a duty to set the record straight. I do not know what was discussed in the House because I was in the other House. I had to lay certain papers on the Table of the House there. I did not know whether I was required here. After doing my work there, I went home. The Leader of the House phoned me that the House wants my presence. So, I have come.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): You are a hero today.

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: I can only presume that it must be relating to what was published in the newspapers today. So, I want to say one thing very categorically that this interview of mine was taken for the "Pritish Nandy Show" about 2 months back. I have the cassette in my house which was taken on that day and which was flashed on Doordarshan. I have checked up every portion of my cassette. The portions which have been circulated by some of the political parties or persons, are not a part of the Doordarshan talk.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): You mean censored portion?

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: They are not a part of that cassette which I carry. As a matter of fact, when we go out and make statements, we cannot disown them. If I have made a statement and if I have asked them to circulate it on Doordarshan, I fully stand by it. But I can assure you that some unauthorised circulation, some mischievous circulation has taken place and I am likely to give a notice to the person who took this interview to give me what he has circulated. I have also asked my family to check up whether this is the thing. This is a matter where the House will realise that if I have given something and it has come on Doordarshan, it cannot remain a secret, but if something behind the scenes has happened, I expect the House to stand by me because this type of blackmail should not be allowed. It is pure and simple blackmail. You call me to your house and say that you are not going to do this and that, and you do that. I never expected that this will happen. And if this has happened, I want to take full action against the person who has done it.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त) : सदर साहब, सवाल यह है, बुनियादी सवाल.. (**व्यवधान**) मैं खाली यह कहना चाहता हूं.. (**व्यवधान**) मैं बुनियादी बात कहना चाहता हूं कि अभी ऑनरेबुल मेम्बर ने यह नहीं कहा है कि जो बातें सरकुलेट हुई हैं—वे दूरदर्शन पर आई हों या न आई हों उससे हमें कोई गरज नहीं है—हम जानना चाहते हैं कि क्या

वे शब्द आपकी जबान से निकले या नहीं ?

†نیتا وردھی دل شری سکندر بخت:
صدر صاحب سوال یہ ہے۔ بنیادی سوال
....."مداخلت" میں خالی یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں
کہ ابھی آنریبل ممبر نے یہ نہیں کہا ہے
کہ جو باتیں سرکولیٹ ہوئی ہیں وہ دوردرشن
پر آئی ہوں یا نہ آئی ہو۔ اس سے ہمیں
کوئی غرض نہیں ہے۔ ہم جاننا چاہتے ہیں
کہ کیا وہ شبد آپکی زبان سے نکلے یا نہیں۔

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : कौन से शब्द जो मेरे पास में ह । . . (**व्यवधान**) सुनिये । आप सुनिये मेरी बात अगर आपने पूछना चाहा है । डाक्टर जे.के. ज़न के स्टूडियो में यह बात हुई थी और अगर वे ईमान से हलफनामा लेकर आपको भी कह देंगे कि मैंने यह कहा कि यह दूरदर्शन हर दे दो तो मैं मुस्तफी हो जाऊंगा हाउस से । यह क्या बात आप कर रहे हैं, और अगर आप किसी से चोरी-छिपे कुछ बात करते हो तो आपको नहीं सपोर्ट चाहिए ।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : नहीं-नहीं, मैं सपोर्ट नहीं कर रहा हूं ।

†نیتا وردھی دل شری سکندر بخت"
نہیں نہیں میں سپورٹ نہیں کر رہا ہوں۔

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: You are a senior Member.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मैं सपोर्ट नहीं कर रहा हूं भारद्वाज साहब . . (**व्यवधान**) सदर साहब, मेरी एक गुजारिश सुन लें । मेरी बात बहुत सीधी है । चाहे यह चोरी छिपे रिकार्ड किया गया हो चाहे इसको दूरदर्शन पर आना हो या न आना हो हम यह जानना चाहते हैं कि क्या ये शब्द आपकी जबान से निकले । मैं उसका फायदा नहीं उठाना चाहता हूं ।

†شری سکندر بخت: میں سپورٹ نہیں کر رہا ہوں
بھاردواج صاحب۔: مداخلت" صدر صاحب میری
ایک گزارش سن لیں میری بات بہت سیدھی ہے۔
چاہے یہ چوری چھپے ریکارڈ کیا گیا ہو۔ چاہے اس
کو دوردرشن پر آنا ہو یا نہ آنا ہو ہم یہ جاننا چاہتے
ہیں کہ کیا یہ شبد آپکی زبان سے نکلے۔ میں اس کا
فائدہ نہیں اٹھانا چاہتا۔

(**व्यवधान**)

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : फायदा इससे ज्यादा क्या उठाओगे । आप मुझे अपने घर दावत दो और वहां जाकर मेरी जेब काट लो । यह कैसे हो सकता है । आप कैसे होस्ट हैं . . (**व्यवधान**)

एक माननीय सदस्य : मतलब बात वहीं है ।

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : आप कैसे होस्ट ह ?

(**व्यवधान**)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहब, मेरी बात का तो कोई जवाब आया नहीं । मैंने तो बहुत मोअदबाना अज किया है . . . (**व्यवधान**)

†شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحب میری بات
کا تو کوئی جواب آیا نہیں۔ میں نے تو بہت مؤدبانہ
عرض کیا ہے۔۔"مداخلت"۔۔۔

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : सिकन्दर बख्त साहब मैं आपकी बहुत इज्जत करता हूं। आप जरा अपने एम.पी. से और उनसे इन्क्वायरी कर लो जो लेकर आए थे, कि क्या हुआ है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): आपने जिस दोस्ताना अंदाज से सवाल पूछा वैसे ही उन्होंने जवाब दिया है।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मेरा सवाल बेहद स्पेसिफिक है। मैं सिर्फ यह कहना चाहता हूं कि जो शब्द आज तकलीफदेह साबित हो रहे हैं वे शब्द आपकी जबान से निकले या नहीं। सिर्फ इतना जानना चाहता हूं।

†نیتا ورودھی دل: شری سکندر بخت: میرا سوال بیحد اسپیسیفک ہے۔ میں صرف یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ جو شبد آج تکلیف دہ ثابت ہو رہے ہیں وہ شبد آپکی زبان سے نکلے یا نہیں صرف اتنا جاننا چاہتا ہوں۔

(व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : ऐसा है, वन सेकेंड, देखिए मैंने पहले ही, शुरू में यह जानना चाहा कि आप एक सदस्य की हैसियत से यहां बात करने आ रहे हैं कि मंत्री की हैसियत से—क्योंकि हमने दोनों चीजें कोट कीं, आपने खुद कहा कि मैं इस सदन का एक सदस्य हूं, इसलिए मेरे ऊपर अगर कोई इलजाम है, कोई बात है, तो मैं जवाब दूंगा। लेकिन आप जानते हैं कि जितने भी माननीय सदस्य हैं, इसके बारे में कुछ जानना चाहते हैं।

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : वे पूछ लें।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): जरा सुन लीजिए। तो आप क्या पसंद करेंगे, जैसे एक-एक सवाल लोग पूछ रहे हैं, उसका आप जवाब देते जायेंगे कि एक साथ आप जवाब देंगे ?

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : मैं हाऊस से कोई बात छिपाना नहीं चाहता, क्योंकि मैंने कोई गलत बात नहीं की है। मैं इस हाऊस की मर्यादा और पालिटिशियंस की मर्यादा की बात कर रहा हूं।

अगर मुझे कहा जाए कि यह सवाल मैं आपको इंटरव्यू लेने के लिए कर रहा हूं और आप इसका जवाब दीजिए, तो जाहिर है कि उसका जवाब अलग होगा। हम लोग लाबी में जितनी बात करते हैं, हम बाहर जाकर कितनी बातें करते हैं, एक-दूसरे के घरों में जाते हैं, यू रिएलइज़ कहां जाकर बात करेंगे। फिर तो यह चीजें खत्म हो जायेंगी।

अगर पूछेंगे, तो मैं सारी बात बताऊंगा जो मेरे साथ उस रोज हुई है।... **(व्यवधान)** तो यह नहीं होना चाहिए। यह मैं इसलिए कह रहा हूं।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Vice-Chairman, you have identified me. So let me seek clarifications...(Interruptions)...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Point of order...(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Please hear.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It is my turn.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): What is your point of order?

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: My point is this: What sort of a discussion will it be, because we are also interested in participating in the discussion? I want your rulig on how we start the discussion. What is our right? It is not that anyone can stand up and speak. So we want to know what our position is so that we

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.

[Shri H. Hanumanthappa]

can also seek clarifications. I want your ruling as to how this will continue.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार) : उन्होंने कहा कि प्राइवेटली कहा। बस यह झगड़ा खत्म हो गया।... (**व्यवधान**)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Hanumanthappa, please hear.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): There need not be any clarification, Sir. It is an explanation.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, may I start?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (**श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह**) : श्री हनुमनतप्पा ने एक सवाल उठाया और मेरी रुलिंग उन्होंने चाही है। आप सुन लीजिए, आपके लिए कह रहा हूं, क्योंकि मैंने शुरु से ही खुद से यह इनिशिएटिव लेकर जानना चाहा कि रूल 241 या 251, किसके अन्तर्गत आप बातें करेंगे ?... (**व्यवधान**)

Please hear me. Don't dictate to me. I am here in the Chair and I can manage.

मंत्री महोदय ने यह कहा—हंसराज भारद्वाज जी ने यह कहा कि मैं 241 के अन्तर्गत अपनी बात कहने जा रहा हूं, लेकिन भारद्वाज जी इस बात को जानते हैं कि आप इस सदन के माननीय सदस्य हैं, लेकिन आप भारत सरकार के मंत्री भी हैं। तो आपकी दो हैसियत बनती हैं। फिर जब सवाल आपसे सिकन्दर बख्त जी ने किया, तो आपने कहा कि मैं जवाब दूंगा।

तो मैं यह समझता हूं कि जो उन्होंने प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर उठाया है, उसके अन्तर्गत मेरी अपनी रुलिंग यह बनती है कि चूंकि आपने खुद कहा है कि मैं सवालों का जवाब दूंगा, तो अगर माननीय सदस्यों के मन में जो सवाल उठते हैं, उनका जवाब आपको देना चाहिए।

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: I have no objection. If one or two Members want to put questions, I have no objection. But they should think that they are putting the questions to an hon. Member.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): But I would request you to first hear.

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: And that should be strictly as what I said, that I will only stand by my statement on Doordarshan, and no private statement. I will investigate what other things happened.

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (महाराष्ट्र) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (**श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह**) : नहीं, नहीं अब नहीं।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, you will kindly recollect that we wanted a clarification from Mr. Bhardwaj as an hon. Minister.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: When he was supposed to have made this statement, he was a Minister. So, that statement was made... (*Interruptions*)...

Please. Let me complete my submission.

When he was supposed to have made the statement either on record or off the record, he was a Minister. Mr. Pritish Nandy took the interview of the Minister in his capacity as a Minister, number one.

AN HON. MEMBER: How do you know it?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It was telecast on Doordarshan. He was introduced to the audience as the Minister for Law and Justice.

Secondly and more importantly, Mr. Vice-Chairman, the hon. Minister must be complimented for not being disloyal to his own statement. He did not deny the statement attributed to him. I, there-

fore, would like to take this opportunity to compliment him on his persistent truthfulness.

The statement may have been made off the record. The statement may have been recorded surreptitiously, deceptively, but the statement, I must say, in fairness to my friend, Mr. Bhardwaj, he made from the bottom of his heart, on sure knowledge of the facts of the case.

He is, of course, a good lawyer and indeed a good Law Minister. I am sure he would also be a good citizen... (*Interruptions*). Please.

No citizen, under the law of the land, can withhold truth from the law-enforcing agencies in regard to crimes committed. According to his undenied statement, some Ministers took money from Mr. Harshad Mehta, which, under the law of the land, is a crime. Therefore, the hon. Minister, Mr. Bhardwaj should tell the House which Ministers took money, in what fashion and for what reason because I credit Mr. Bhardwaj with full knowledgeability.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DALAL SINGH): Dr. Abrar Ahmed.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. ABRAR AHMED): Sir,...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: On a point of order? What are you trying to say?

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): What is he going to reply?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Is it on behalf of the Government? ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Jaipal Reddy, if he wants to say something, kindly hear him.

डा० अबरार अहमद : सर, भारद्वाज जी को जैसे ही आपने बोलने की अनुमति दी, एक बात आपने कैटेगारिकली पूछा कि आप 241 के तहत बोलना चाहते हैं या 251 के तहत, मैं पहले तो दोनों नियमों को यहां पढ़ कर सुनाना चाहता हूं।... (**व्यवधान**)

First you listen to me. Please, Sir, allow me to speak.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, भारद्वाज जी ने स्वीकार कर लिया और आपने अपनी व्यवस्था भी दे दिया... (**व्यवधान**)...मेरी आपत्ति है, मान्यवर... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर लाल सिंह) : मालवीय जी, पहले इनको सुनाने दीजिए। उसके बाद... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : उसके बाद आप अपनी व्यवस्था दे दीजिए।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : ठीक है, मैं व्यवस्था दे दूंगा। इनको बात कहने दीजिए... (**व्यवधान**)...इनको अपनी बात कहने दीजिए, उसके बाद।

डा० अबरार अहमद : जो भी सदन की कार्रवाई चलती है वह नियमों के तहत ही चलती है। नियम पहले कोट की उसके बाद चालू हुआ।

Rule 241 says:

"A member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the Council, but in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward, and no debate shall arise."

This is Rule 241.

Rule 251 says:

"A statement may be made by a Minister on a matter of public importance with the consent of the Chairman but no question shall be asked at the time the statement is made."

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Now the statement is over.

DR. ABRAR AHMED: In both the cases nobody can ask any question. This is one thing. सर, जब ऑनरेबल मेंबर भारद्वाज जी ने स्पष्ट कर दिया कि जो वहां इंटरव्यू लिया गया था, उस इंटरव्यू की जो बातें यहां कही गयी हैं, वह उस कैसेट और उस इंटरव्यू का पार्ट नहीं हैं । ऑफ द रकार्ड बहुत-सी बातें यह सही है कि सदन उठने के बाद सदन में भी, लॉबी में भी और बाहर करते हैं और उन बातों को लेकर अगर सदन का टाइम बर्बाद किया जाता है तो यह बिल्कुल गलत है । दोनों नियमों में सवाल पूछने की बात कहीं नहीं आती है ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Yes, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, please sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I have not yet completed Sir. Our Parliamentary Affairs Minister rose only on a point of order. It was the House that demanded the presence of the Law Minister, who kindly responded to the request of the House and he gave certain explanation and we are seeking clarifications based on his explanation. I am not concerned with the rules. Under a *suo motu* statement we are all entitled to seek clarifications. We treat it as a *suo motu* statement.

DR. ABRAR AHMED: We are all concerned.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Abrar Sahib, please hear me. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: There is a precedent also. Mr. Sontosh Mohan Dev made a statement when allegations were made.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : अबरार अहमद साहब सुनिए, आपने जो आपत्ति उठायी है... (व्यवधान)..... ठहरिए, आपने जो आपत्ति उठायी है, मैंने शुरु में ही यह कहना चाहा और कहा, लेकिन स्वयं भारद्वाज जी ने यह कहा कि उन बातों का जवाब देंगे ।

डा० अबरार अहमद : सब के सवालों का जवाब देने के लिए नहीं कहा था, एकाध मेंबर अगर पूछना चाहते हैं तो उसके लिए उन्होंने कहा था कि

I will give a reply. There should be no debate. **You can ask again.**

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : उन्होंने खुद स्वीकार किया है ।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहब, मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि ऑनरेबल मिनिस्टर क्या उन्हें रोकना चाहते हैं ? अगर कोई सफाई आ रही है तो मेहरबानी कर के उसके रास्ते में रुकावट न डालिए ।..... (व्यवधान)...यह रुकावट डालना तो उसे गुनाह होगा, बदतर-अज-गुनाह होगा ।

डा० अबरार अहमद : सर, सदन का समय बहुत कीमती है और इस तरह सदन का समय बर्बाद हो रहा है ।..... (व्यवधान)...

That is off the record. That is not part of the record. Constinuously he has been saying this. This should not be turned into a debate. We have got other business. We have got Government business.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The short point is, Mr. Vice-Chairman, that none of the statements attributed to the Minister. Mr. Bhardwaj, has been denied. And what do the statements say? "According to the statements recorded, Mr. Bhardwaj believes that many Ministers took bribes from Mr. Harshad Mehta. He also believes from his intimate personal knowledge that Mr. Harshad Mehta had access to the bed-rooms of many Ministers.

DR. ABRAR AHMED: Which Government Minister?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: He has named the Ministers. His complaint was that Mr. Harshad Mehta did not reach because he was...

श्री शमीम हाशमी : (बिहार) : वाइस चैयरमैन सर...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : ठीक है, पहले आप अपनी सीट पर बैठिए ।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Bhardwaj is a Minister right now and those against whom he levelled allegations are also Ministers. This Cabinet is governed by the principle of collective responsibility. Therefore, Mr. Vice-Chairman, my demand is either the Law Minister resigns or the Ministers against whom he levelled allegations resign. There is no other alternative.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, कभी हम लोगों का भी नंबर आएगा ? कुछ लोग हर वक्त बोलते रहते हैं और उन्हें हर वक्त इजाजत मिल जाती है ।

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI (Gujarat): It is true. The back-benchers never get a chance. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I feel more embarrassed.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, हम को भी समय दीजिए ?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : मैं सभी को समय दूंगा ।

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : पहले हमें दीजिए।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) आपको भी दूंगा ।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I feel more embarrassed by the statement that the hon. Minister has made. We are not going to the point whether the tape-recorded version was unauthorisedly circulated or it was properly authorised by him. We are not going into facts whether Mr. Bhardwaj has authorised its circulation. That, of course, is a matter between him and the person who has recorded his statement. What has agitated our mind is the merit of the case. We always believe that if a Minister has in his possession any information regarding a breach of law, then, as a Minister of Law he should have brought the thing either to the notice of the investigating agency or to the Government which he belonged. The most imporant part is, Mr. Bhardwaj has never said, "I did not speak all these things to the person who has recorded." That is the important part.

Secondly, I feel intrigued because his statement was recorded in the studio of another Members of the House. His statement was recorded in the studio of Mr. Jain, who is also an hon. Minister (Interruptions)... sorry, an hon. Member of this House who dreams to be a Minister. Therefore, Sir, I feel more intrigued by the statement that he has made.

(**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN** in the Chair)

Because of that I will only implore upon the Minister that as a part of the discharging of his Constitutional responsibility, let nim unburden himself of all the facts. Let him say, "I said this thing. But I never authorised it to be circulated." Let him say, "I I did not say this thing." Therefore, the question is, he must tell the House whether he has said this thing or not and after saying this thing whether he has stated, "It should not be circulated." Whenever members of the press come to us, we speak to them.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the discussion that is going on now?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam,, I have been authorised by the hon. Chairperson who was here before you to..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On what?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I would conclude within one minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I only want to know, what are we discussing?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: About the statement which he has made. I am asking my last question. Whenever we speak to the press people or when we have occasion to speak to the media persons we tell them, "This is my opinion. But don't write it. Don't circulate it." Of course, we speak to them but request them not to circulate it. Therefore, my last question is, after saying this thing whether he has requested Pritish Nandy not to circulate it. Therefore, we want to know whether the circulation of the statement was done by Pritish Nandy on the basis of your statement which you never authorised. In that case you are guilty on two counts. You are guilty of making a statement and you are guilty of withholding a statement. Therefore, as a Minister you must tell the House what has happened because it concerns the credibility of the Government, concerns the credibility of the system, concerns the credibility of the entire nation. I wish you would unburden yourself before the House of whatever facts you have in connection with the bribe-taking of the so-called Ministers.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gupta, when a demand was made by many Members in the House that Mr. Bhardwaj should come before the House, I thought that you were going to welcome him. That is what Mr. Sikander Bakht has also said. But you are charging him for something.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We welcomed him. We welcomed his truthfulness.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Welcomed him to elicit information from him.

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: Madam, Deputy Chairman, as I have clarified I have checked up every word of my statement with Doordarshan. These versions which they are reporting..., (*Interruptions*)...

Now some information has been sought. It is said that I have made certain allegations against some Ministers. It is totally untrue. It is totally fabricated and I totally deny this. I have absolutely no knowledge of ahybody being bribed by anybody. This is being put into my mouth and this has been there in the circulation. This is some type of thing which unless I see any other version of my video-tape recording... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL PEDDY: Are you denying?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow. Please sit down. Let the House run in a proper order. Let me handle the situation.

4.00 P.M.

SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ: I am saying it with full responsibility.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhardwaj, will you please take your seat? I want to first understand. Mr. Bhardwaj has come here to give his personal explanation. If he has come here to give a personal explanation, there cannot be any question, there cannot be any discussion on that matter. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Madam, I am afraid you have capsuled it totally out of context.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I have not.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Totally out of context. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Chairperson before you had allowed questions. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me find out from Mr. Bhardwaj. Please sit down.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: I am on a point of order, Madam. (*Interruption*).

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश) : यह एक गंभीर सवाल है, सारे देश का भविष्य इस पर निर्भर करता है ।.... (**व्यवधान**) . . . सारे देश का सवाल है ।

उपसभापति : देश का सवाल अभी देख रहे हैं ।

We are looking at a *"desh ka saval"* only.

Mr. Bhardwaj, some matters were raised in the House regarding some allegations that some... (*Interruptions*). I am authorised to ask him. Please do not make any noise Do not let me be tough. I want to help the House. Mr. Bhardwaj, you were asked to come here to make an explanation. Did you make any statement or did you not make any statement? We have a rule under which a Minister or a Member has a right to make a personal explanation. You have made a personal explanation. According to the rules and "Kaul and Shakdher", there cannot be any discussion on any personal explanation. Under which rule, are you asking him? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We did not seek a personal explanation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Under which rule?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It is incorrect to state that he has given a personal explanation. We demanded an explanation from him as a Minister. We did not demand an explanation from him as a Member, but as a Minister.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Madam, give me a minute, please. (Interruptions).

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): I am on a point of order, Madam. (*Interruptions*).

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मेरी एक गुजारिश सुन लें ।... (**व्यवधान**) . . .गुरुदास जी, लीज़ ।. . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .सदर साहिबा, मैं अर्ज़ करना चाहता हूं, मेरी गुज़ारिश सुन लें । . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .मेरी गुज़ारिश सुनिए प्लीज ।. . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .उपेन्द्र जी, प्लीज ।. . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .सदर साहिबा, सुन लीजिए प्लीज ।

شری سکندر بخت: ڈپٹی چیئرمین صاحبہ۔ اگر کوئی ریسپانس پرائم منسٹر صاحب سے نہیں آتا ہے تو ہم مجبور ہیں کہ ہم اس ہاؤس سے انڈر پروٹسٹ واک آؤٹ کریں۔ ... مداخلت ... ہم واک آؤٹ کر رہے ہیں۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition wants to speak. There is no need to create acrimony in the House. (Interruptions). I am not preventing any ruling. I am not saying anything other than the book. It is a personnal explanation.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No, Madam. It is not a personal explanation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How do you know? He has said it is a personal explanation.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No, it is not.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, जब यह बात शुरू हुई और ऑनरेबल मिनिस्टर ने अपनी बात इस तरीके से कही कि मैंने कोई ऐसी बात जो दूरदर्शन में नहीं है, मैं उस बात से अपने आपको एसोसिएट नहीं करता हूं । तो मैंने बगैर भाषण के एक सीधी सी बात पूछी थी कि जो कुछ सरक्यूलेट हुआ है उसमें आपके दूरदर्शन के अलावा भी कुछ बातें हैं, हम सिर्फ यह जानना चाहते हैं कि वह आपकी जबान से निकलीं या नहीं निकलीं? जवाब नहीं मिला।

दूसरा, आपसे पहले जो सदारत फरमा रहे थे उन्होंने कहा कि रूल 241 या 251, आप किसके मातहात बात करना चाहते हैं ? तो ऑनरेबल मिनिस्टर ने फरमाया कि वह एक राज्य सभा के मैम्बर की हैसियत से बात करना चाहते हैं, बस। सवाल यह है कि बहुत देर तक जो बातें होती रहीं, यह डिनायल की बात तो अब आई है, उस वक्त तो उसको सरकमवेंट करते रहे कि मैंने दूरदर्शन के लिए कोई बात नहीं कही । कोई कॉरीडोर में कोई बात कह दे, कोई कहीं कोई बात कर दे, उसको रिकार्ड का हिस्सा नहीं बनाया जा सकता । उस वक्त तक यह पोजिशन थी ।

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script.

इस वक्त आखिरी हिस्से में आकर उन्होंने उसको डिनाई किया है कि इस किस्म की बातें, अब हम यह जानना चाहते हैं कि उनके स्टेटमेंट का पहला हिस्सा दुरुस्त था या डिनायल हिस्सा दुरुस्त है ?

†شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ جب یہ بات شروع ہوئی اور آنریبل منسٹر نے اپنی بات اس طریقہ سے کہی کہ میں نے کوئی ایسی بات جو دوردرشن میں نہیں ہے میں اس بات سے اپنے آپکو ایسوسی ایٹ نہیں کرتا ہوں۔ تو میں نے بغیر بھاشن کے ایک سیدھی سی بات پوچھی تھی کہ جو کچھ سپر کوریٹ ہوا ہے اس میں آپکے دوردرشن کے علاوہ بھی کچھ باتیں ہیں ہم صرف یہ جاننا چاہتے ہیں کہ وہ آپکی زبان سے نکلی یا نہیں نکلیں جواب نہیں ملا۔

دوسرا آپ سے پہلے جو صدارت فرما رہے تھے انہوں نے کہا کہ رول ۲۴۱ یا ۲۵۱ آپ کس کے تحت بات کرنا چاہتے ہیں تو آنریبل منسٹر نے فرمایا کہ وہ ایک راجیہ سبھا کے ممبر کی حیثیت سے بات کرنا چاہتے ہیں بس سوال یہ ہے کہ بہت دیر تک جو باتیں ہوتی رہیں۔ یہ ڈینائل کی بات تو اب آتی ہے۔ اس وقت تو اس کو سپر کمیٹ کرتے رہے کہ میں نے دوردرشن کے لئے کوئی بات نہیں کہی۔ کوئی کوری ڈور میں کوئی بات کہہ دے۔ کوئی کہیں کوئی بات کہہ دے۔ اس کو ریکارڈ کا حصہ نہیں بنایا جا سکتا۔ اس وقت تک یہ پوزیشن تھی۔ اس وقت آخری حصہ میں آکر انہوں نے اس کو ڈینائی کیا ہے کہ اس قسم کی باتیں۔ اب ہم جاننا چاہتے ہیں کہ ان کے اسٹیٹمنٹ کا پہلا حصہ درست تھا یا ڈینائل حصہ درست ہے۔

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : मैडम, मैं आपको इत्तिला कर दूं क्योंकि आप नहीं थीं यहां . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking one question, Mr. Bhardwaj. I would ask the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. (*Interruption*) I will allow your point of order. Please take your seat now. Let me first find out that. It would not even take a quarter of a minute. I was not in the Chair, first. Mr. Parliamentary Affairs Minister, when Mr. Bhardwaj came to the House, did he give a *suo motu* statement or did he come to give a personal explanation under rule 241? I am asking him. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: How does the Minister know? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I won't allow this. (*Interruptions*) I will adjourn the House. (*Interruptions*) There should be order in the House. Please take your seats. (*Interruptions*) I will adjourn the House. (*Interruptions*)

The House is adjourned for the day.

The House then adjourned at seven minutes past four of the clock till eleven of the clock on Thursday, the 29th July, 1993.